

## MINUTES

Those in Attendance: Chairman Adam Bills, Vice-Chairman Dennis Groff (by telephone), Supervisors: Ray Rice, Craig Keenan and Marlin Groff, Secretary/Treasurer Karen Farra, Zoning Officer Walter Hockensmith, Township Solicitor Frank Mincarelli, Roger A. Fry, PLS, Fry Surveying, Inc., WGAL New reporter and cameraperson, multiple residents of Paradise Township and its surrounding communities, to include members of the various emergency service organizations serving the residents of Paradise Township.

### MINUTES

- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the September 15, 2021 Workshop Minutes. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Marline Groff **motioned** to approve the September 21, 2021 Board of Supervisors Meeting Minutes. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

### TREASURERS REPORT/BILLS

- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the September 2021 Treasurer's Report. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the October 2021 Disbursement List of Bills to be paid. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

### PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Roger A. Fry, PLS, Frying Surveying, Inc., regarding the following matters:
  - Eli S & Anna Ruth Esh - 853A Strasburg Rd: (1) Rettew October 4, 2021 review letter; (2) request for waiver of Section 403.3 Existing Conditions Plan; (3) request for Planning Waiver & Non-building Declaration; and (4) request for plan approval. Craig Keenan **motion** for approval of all waivers and *conditional* approval of plans. Second by Marlin Groff. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
  - Emanuel Fisher – 268 S. Kinzer Rd: (1) Request for Planning Waiver & Non-Building Declaration; (2) Request for Waiver from Section 603 & Section 603.1A, Access Drive Construction Standards and Collector Street Design Standards; (3) Request for Waiver from Section 603.1B, Access Drive Width; (4) Request for Waiver from Section 603.1F, Access Drive Setback fro Property Lines; (5) Request for Waiver from Section 603.1G, Landscape Setback. Before the Board were copies of Mr. Fry's two September 17, 2021 letters providing revised plans and setting forth his waiver requests, and Rettew's October 15, 2021 plan review letter and recommendations. Mr. Fry presented to the Board his October 19, 2021 letter in response to Rettew's review letter and revised plans.
    - Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve all waiver and modification requests. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
    - Marlin Groff **motioned** for *conditional* approval of the plans. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Melvin & Hannah Petersheim – 91 Iva Road: Request for Planning Waiver & Non-Building Declaration. Before the Board were copies of Rettew’s August 10, 2021 plan review letter, County of Lancaster Planning Commission’s August 11, 2021 Memorandum of Advisory Plan Review Comments, Mr. Fry’s August 12, 2021 letter to the Township addressing the County of Lancaster Planning Commission’s review comments, and Mr. Fry’s October 1, 2021 letter in response to Rettew’s August 10, 2021 review letter. Mr. Fry presented to the Board during the meeting revised plans and request conditional approval of the revised plans.
  - Craig Keenan **motioned** for approval of the waiver request and *conditional* approval of the revised plans presented at the meeting. Second by Marlin Groff. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

**CORRESPONDENCE:**

- Invitation to Celebration for Les Houck on November 17, 2021.
- October 5, 2021 letter from Pequea Valley Public Library expressing thanks for donation.

**TOWNSHIP REPORTS**

**PLANNING COMMISSION:**

- Craig Keenan presented the October 5, 2021 Minutes of the Planning Commission.

**ZONING HEARING BOARD:**

- Reports submitted by Zoning Officer, Walter Hockensmith.
- 32 Hershey Avenue - Ratify Dog Law Enforcement Notice Dated October 6, 2021
  - Marlin Groff **motioned** to add this matter to the meeting Agenda. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
  - Marlin Groff **motioned** to ratify the October 6, 2021 Dog Law Enforcement Notice. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

**PARK & RECREATION COMMISSION:**

- Updates by Supervisor, Ray Rice.
- Mr. Rice advised of an additional \$10,000 donation to the Park Foundation be received that is not included on the Balance Sheet provided.
- Mr. Rice informed the Board the Park Foundation is looking to change banks.
- Mr. Rice advised the ballfield lights are scheduled for replaced in the next 2 to 3 weeks.

**ROADMASTER:**

- Update provide by Roadmaster/Supervisor, Dennis Groff. Mr. Groff informed the Board he is awaiting the proposal for line painting to be finalized.

## SEWER AUTHORITY & SEO:

- Update provided by Roadmaster/Supervisor, Dennis Groff. He advised design work for sewer plant upgrades are on track.

## OLD/NEW BUSINESS:

- Distribution of 2022 Notice of Public Meetings to review for November Vote.
- Chairman Bills announced Trick-or-Treat will be held on Friday, October 29, 2021, from 6:00pm to 8:00pm.
- Ronald E. Blank – 271 S. Belmont Rd: September 14, 2021 approval letter from the Lancaster County Conservation District provided to the Board as briefing item only.
- Benuel K. Fisher – Strasburg & Esbenshade Roads: DEP Sewer Planning Module and Resolution to adopt same presented to the Board for approval. Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Discussion on change in first due response territories.
  - Chairman Bills read press release to those in attendance.
  - Township Solicitor, Frank Mincarelli, addressed the public to advise a time limit will be set on the amount of time each person can speak, and the discussion is to be limited to the proposed changes to the first due response territories. He further advised that no action would be taken at this meeting on this matter.
  - Marlin Groff **motioned** to limit public comment to 3 minutes per person. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

## PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

Chairman Bills opened the floor for public comment requesting each person state their name, township of residence, and/or organization they belong to when called upon to comment.

- Michael Hartmann asked if public comment would be limited to Paradise Township residents only. Mr. Bills said no - public comment is open to everyone.
- Thomas Whittington, Paradise resident. You stated at the beginning of what you read that Gordonville & Paradise are within 1 mile of each other. Chairman Bills confirmed they are .9 miles apart to be exact. Mr. Whittington asked how did the Board come up with the decision that it would be better services to the Township if these two were to come together and asked where the new fire station would be located if the consolidation goes through. Mr. Bills advised the as far as the distance the Board believes the response time Township cannot answer this until such time as a consolidation of emergency services were to occur and confirmed the Board would not be voting on consolidation at the next meeting only the change of first due territories. He further advised the Township is not shutting down the Paradise/Leaman Fire Company - they will become a mutual aid station. They would not be taken out of service and would maintain their own equipment.
- Ron Heckley. Before a decision is made he feels a questionnaire should be put out to the fire companies to determine whether or not merger should happen
- Jamie, Paradise resident, asked how did the Township come up with the decision that it would be best for them to combine and what are the facts the decision was based upon. Chairman Bills explained that this discussion has been going on for years before this Board even began to discuss

it, but what inspired this current discussion was the Township learning that the two fire companies (Paradise/Leaman Fire Company and Gordonville Fire & EMS) were intending to each build new multimillion dollar facilities within less than one mile of each other. Explained the Township is trying to look forward in considering a consolidation. Expressed her support of the Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Later, in response to other comments, Jamie stated that a change of locations would make response times suffer more as a result of Amish people being further away from the station(s). Mr. Bills explained that if a consolidation were to occur and a new location for a fire station considered, these are issues that would be discussed as part of that consolidation effort. Later yet, Jamie asked what would happen with Paradise's equipment and reserves. Mr. Bills and Marlin Groff explained that would be determined by their by-laws, but they would hope they would join the consolidation and all equipment would come with them.

- Jack Coleman, Paradise resident, expressed appreciation of Board for looking forward and asked if the Board of Supervisors sat down with Paradise/Leaman and Kinzer Fire Companies. Chairman Adams advised that yes, there were multiple meetings with all three fire companies (Paradise/Leaman Fire Company, Kinzer Fire Company and Gordonville Fire & EMS) and explained looking to create a new entity and potentially one new centrally located fire station in addition to the existing stations if consolidation were to occur.
- Noah Fisher, Paradise Lane. Mr. Fisher asked did you ever see that bigger is better? Commented that the fire companies appear to be in a competition for control and that is what is causing the issues here. He is afraid that will not work because too many people want to be in control of the whole community. Commented that all people are not pulling in the same direction and the Board needs to make sure that is happening. Chairman Bills said that is what the Board has been trying very hard to do. Supervisor Marlin Groff thanked Mr. Fisher for his comments.
- Amos Stoltzfus, Paradise. Commented for how many years have the three fire companies operated successfully as they are and the change in number of calls now verses 20 years ago. Most times smaller is better.
- Marik Tommassetti, Leacock Township. Commented that Paradise has increased membership and has had better response times since he moved out of the Township. How does it make sense for Gordonville to take over their territory when they are further away? How did they come to the conclusion 43 should run our area instead of Paradise? Chairman Bills responded that a consolidation of emergency services would likely result in better response times and that the change of first due territories is a necessary step to move towards a consolidation.
- Unknown Gentlemen (name could not be heard). Has a study been done to determine if other two fire companies can handle the calls without Paradise/Leaman Fire Company? Chairman Bills responded no a study has not been done, but in discussions with the other organizations, the Board does not believe this would cause an excess burden on those organizations. Asked how Paradise would get calls if first due territories are change. Mr. Bills explained the Chief's for each station have call boxes and can call in Paradise as for mutual aid if the call warrants it, but Paradise would not get the initial first dispatch call. Asked for explanation of consolidation. Mr. Bills explained that consolidation is the creation of a new single entity. Commented that Mr. Bills mentioned that a location for a new fire station location has not been discussed. Mr. Bills confirmed this is correct and explained that this is something that would be determined during the consolidation process. He was told that Township was looking at the Garment Factory beside Leaman Place and also the land in back of it to build a station there. Chairman Bills advised that is not true - this Board has not had any discussion in that regard and it would be the decision of the fire companies - the consolidated entity - to discuss the location of any new station. The fire company could look into that, but the Township has not.

- Mr. Glick, S. Vintage Road. Stated he is not a fire fighter - he just enjoys what he knows about Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. They do an excellent job. Why would a fire company cross county lines? How would you feel if you and your family live in lower Paradise Township and had to wait on Gordonville? Feels this is a step toward paid fire fighters and he does not want that. Chairman Bills stated that area is in Strasburg's territory and municipal lines should not prohibit working together to provide services to the community and its residents, and respectfully disagreed that this would be a step toward paid staff as he believes a consolidation of resources would make services more efficient and help to further prevent the need for paid staff. Pointed out that any consolidation is not just Paradise/Leaman and Gordonville - it includes Kinzer as well. Asked if Chairman Bills is a member of Kinzer Fire Company. Chairman Bills advised he is not - he is not a member of any fire company.
- Henry Stoltzfus, Paradise Lane. Mr. Stoltzfus commented that where he lives on Paradise Lane he is currently under Strasburg right now, but Paradise/Leaman is who responds timely. How is he supposed to feel about the Township Supervisors taking away Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Why not keep Paradise there for their side of Township and Gordonville for the other side? Mr. Bills stated the Supervisor believed there has been ongoing discussions about Paradise Township trying to take over all Paradise fire companies - that is not true. The Board just thought response time would be better by Kinzer or Gordonville for a portion of Strasburg's current territory simply due to the time for Strasburg to travel through town and the railroad area, but that can be revisited.
- John Stoltzfus, Strasburg Fire Company. Commented that he is shocked by the Townships proposed change in first due territories. They have had a great relationship with Paradise/Leaman Fire Company for years. He feels politics are what is getting in the way and wishes could sit down with neighboring Chiefs to discuss this matter. As is, the Township would be putting Paradise/Leaman Fire Company out of business. Accused Gordonville of putting Paradise out of business. Discussed change of Strasburg's first due territory. Chairman Bills explained the process for producing the proposed first due territory map and that it is not precise and will need to be fixed. The Board needs to discuss more fully any changes to the Strasburg first due territory. Mr. Stoltzfus stated he would like to see a third option discussed. Supervisor Marlin Groff expressed the Boards' vision for the consolidation of all three fire companies (Paradise, Kinzer and Gordonville) and the lack of Paradise's unwillingness to participate in the process. He further said the Strasburg territory needs to be reviewed more closely. Later, asked how long did the Township meet with the fire companies? Chairman Adams advised from February 2021 to July 2021. Commented that Paradise/Leaman has been around for 114 years. It took years for them to get to where they are today and the Township takes 5 months? Feels the Township is taking the easy way out and gave up. Stated this does not need to be rushed and the Township need to revisit the matter.
- Elmer Esh, Esbenshade Rd, Strasburg. Commented why is the Township trying to fix something that is not broken. He feels this is a power grab by Gordonville. Things are working as they are.
- No name provided. Asked who made the map. Chairman Bills answered that the Township did. The Board approved the lines as drawn. Asked if there were any secret private meetings with Gordonville? Chairman Bills stated he spoke consulted with the Chiefs of Kinzer and Gordonville in preparing the map. Asked if Chairman Bills has any private relationships or associations with Gordonville. Chairman Bills said no. Asked if the Township had any part in purchasing garment factory. Mr. Bills said no. Stated the Township is moth-balling Paradise/Leaman and is siding with Gordonville. Commented it only takes 300 votes to impeach a Supervisor.

- Unnamed gentleman asked Mr. Bills if he played golf with Gordonville. Mr. Bills said he did and was even invited by Paradise to play golf, but had to decline due to a scheduling conflict.
- Clint Younce, Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Commented that Gordonville has paid EMS and fireman who respond to calls. They come to their calls even though they are supposed to be to be on ambulance and this is how they get out quicker - they have crew there 24 hours.
- Missy, Paradise Township. Commented that Paradise/Leaman Fire Company will lose volunteers and said where is the money coming from to get equipment that Paradise/Leaman has that Kinzer and Gordonville don't have? Paradise has a boat and they don't. The Township doesn't want money spent on two new buildings, but it will have to be spent to get the equipment that Paradise has and Kinzer and Gordonville do not.
- Unknown Gentleman - name not provided. Commented that the Board needs to consider loss of service and equipment if Paradise doesn't exist.
- Bob Devonshire, Paradise Township, runs with Strasburg Fire Company. Doesn't feel this is an emergent need and glad to see Board is working through DCED. Commented that consolidation is the way of the future and offered to Chair a new committed made up of uninvolved parties and encouraged the Township to take time to do this – feels this is the best way to go. Asked if the Township will continue to provide Workers' Compensation Insurance for Paradise/Leaman Fire Company.
- Rich, Paradise Township. Commented he disagrees with consolidation and feels it will lead towards paid fire company, as it always does, and then who will pay that bill
- Jack Holeman. Does the Township want community input? Chairman Bills said yes, that is why the Board is laying out this proposal tonight.
- David King, Paradise Township. Commented that as a farmer, he has seen consolidation in all aspects of life and it has never worked out. Gave example of local bank changing hands multiple times. He asked that the Board please listen to the community.
- Ron Heckley. Commented that is important for the people to have a voice in this decision and that the Board should do a community survey and accept the results of that survey, and not leave the decision to a 5 member Board.
- Sam Petersheim. Mr. Petersheim disclosed he has no involvement with any of the fire companies. He stated he has been coming to these Tuesday night Board meetings for 3 years now and this has been a topic of discussion for all of those years, yet this is the first time he has seen people show up. He said this is not the first night this has been discussed and told all that he fights with the Board - they are not his friends and emphasized the importance of coming to meetings, being involved and, generally, supported Boards position with regard to providing opportunity for the community to voice their opinions and concerns during the discussions.
- Sam Stoltzfus, Paradise Township. Would the Township consider maintaining Station 43 for EMS coverage with Paradise/Leaman and Intercourse covering their first due area? Would the Township consider a new fire station at Paradise/Leaman with a consolidation for fire services only? Supervisor Marlin Groff commented that this is a possibility; however, the issue has been the Board has not been happy with the independent nature of the fire companies and negative competition. The Township is struggling to make the conversation for consolidation happen without success, so has been placed in position to force the dialogue and that is what this is. It is not too late for Paradise to engage. Ultimately, the Board wants to see all of the fire companies come together.
- Barry Yunkin, Paradise/Leaman Fire Company President. Stated he wants to clarify that Paradise/Leaman has said they are not interested in a merger at this time, but they are willing to listen. The Task Force never came up with anything - what do we have to listen to. Supervisor

Marlin Groff and Chairman Bills said the Board has been listening and Paradise has been listening and that has what brought us to this point tonight. Mr. Groff asked Mr. Yunkin what did he hear. Mr. Yunkin they heard nothing - the Task Force came up with nothing. Stated that to say Paradise said just said no is not fair - they heard nothing from the Task Force and have heard nothing since. Sam Petersheim commented that there is a meeting Tuesday evenings. Mr. Bills clarified the Township has had no conversation with Gordonville nor Kinzer until now – there have been no secret meetings.

- Daniel Beiler, Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Stated that a year ago the Board did not have a Township public meeting, they met in private with each of the Chiefs from Kinzer and Gordonville and did not include Paradise. Requested an explanation of this. Chairman Bills stated that before that, the Board met with all the leaders of all three fire companies in early 2020 for a basic conversation and Paradise/Leaman had no interest then. The Board tried again, with the new leadership and Paradise/Leaman still had no interest, but he cannot speak as to those meetings as he was not part of them. Marlin Groff, said we need to get beyond that one meeting - there have been several meetings in which Paradise has consistently expressed they were not interested in consolidation.
- Neal Hershey, Chief Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Commented that he attended last months' Board of Supervisors Meeting.
- Thomas Whittington. Requested clarity on the conversations going about the room. Who owns the property the Paradise/Leaman fire station is on? Mr. Bills advised Paradise does. Asked so if Paradise chose not to be a part of this, they could sell their equipment off and the building? Mr. Bills said they would have to follow their whatever their by-laws say. Mr. Marlin Groff explained they cannot profit from the sale of the equipment and building. Speaker identified himself as the owner of the property next to Paradise fire hall that the rumor is going around that other entities, not the Township, want to use eminent domain to gain the property that's why he asked in the beginning about the location of a new fire company. Mr. Bills explained that discussion were had during the Task Force meetings about a new location. Asked if this happens and Paradise opts out, Gordonville will stay where they are? Mr. Bills said not necessarily. Asked if Gordonville would have to buy Paradise's property and equipment. Mr. Bills said if they wanted to, yes.
- Jessie Lapp, Paradise Township. When looking at the merger, he sees a number of volunteers opting out as members. He is not against the consolidation, but sees it as less volunteers and Paradise/Leaman has a record of fast response times and being first on site because they are very passionate. They had a fire and Paradise was there before Strasburg. Is okay with a consolidation, but hates to see Paradise/Leaman go away and volunteers quit and he can see that happening.
- Unidentified resident. Is it true that the "head man" here and Gordonville's Chief are best friends and this is what is creating an issue? Mr. Bills said that they are friends, but he wouldn't say best friends. Mr. Marlin Groff said this matter has been going on long before their friendship.
- Jason, Gordonville EMS. Expressed appreciation for everyone being there to have this discussion. Commented that the do have 2 paid EMS and that 1 one of them can also jump on the fire equipment. Disclosed that Gordonville's leadership discusses everything with the members. Their leadership discussed what consolidation would look like with their members and other Chiefs. Gordonville cares deeply about what is best for each organization and the community. He stated that all was silent for them as well after the Task Force meetings concluded until tonight's meeting. Expressed Gordonville supports consolidation.
- Unidentified resident. Asked when the Board would be voting on the resolution to change the first due territories. Chairman Bills responded next month would be the earliest a vote would take place. Asked why this can't wait until next year. The Township Solicitor, Frank Mincarelli, advised

the Board is working with DCED and will follow their procedural recommendations a date cannot be given. Resident feels this should be put to a vote on the ballot next November for the residents to decide rather than the Board. Mr. Mincarelli said the consolidation matter will be brought to the public at another meeting before any decisions are made, but the Township is currently awaiting input from DCED's agent.

- Travis Hoover, Chief, Bart Township Fire Company. Commented he feels the proposed change of first due territories will end Paradise/Leaman Fire company and is not fair - they deserve more than a few days notice. With regard to the proposed map, Chief Hoover said the lines need to be readjusted prior to approval. If the fire station moves another mile away, Bart will likely be able to respond to 741 more quickly. He said the Board needs to evaluate equipment, training and manpower needs before they vote on this as soon as next month.
- Leon Fisher, Deputy Chief, Gordonville Fire & EMS. Stated Gordonville has no intention of putting anyone out of service. With decreased volunteers, he feels that combining is best for everyone and he really wants everyone to work together. Kinzer wants to work with them and they really want the other to work with them as well. With regarding to crossing township lines, he stated Gordonville has responded to over 1400 EMS calls a year in over 20 municipalities.
- Mr. King, Cherry Hill Rd. Asked how much the Township paid for it's building? Chairman Bills said \$1.2 Million. Asked why Township is concerned with cost for new fire stations? Where he lives Paradise would be closest and would respond first. Who would respond under the new proposal? Mr. Bills said Gordonville would. Later, Mr. King commented that Gordonville is not even in Paradise Township so why does the Township care what they pay for a new building. Mr. Bills stated again that this has nothing to do with Township lines, it comes down to two new firehouses being built within 1 mile of each other and what is the best use of community resources.
- Lenny, Strasburg Fire Company. Asked what the cost would be to the Township to build a new fire company. Chairman Bills said he cannot answer that at this point in the process. Did Gordonville look to merge with Leacock why come this way? Mr. Bills explained that what prompted this discussion was learning of two new firehouses being built within 1 mile of each other and what is the best use of resources. Leacock Township has been a part of that conversation.
- Unknown (could not hear name provided), Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Commented that the Township told Paradise they would not be contributing any funds towards the new fire station - Paradise/Leaman intends to raise and fund the construction of their new building.
- Nicole Sterling, Paradise Township. Feels the Township is putting money before the care of the community and its residents. Expressed her support of the Paradise/Leaman Fire Company. Mr. Bills agreed that money is not the only factor, it is simply what generated the conversation. Mr. Bills went back to his statement regarding the long term sustainability of emergency services.
- Unidentified resident (name not provided) asked Mr. Bills if he is telling the truth that Gordonville is because of this? "We" were told that they wanted to consolidate with Intercourse and they said no, so now they are coming this way. Mr. Bills said he would have to ask Leacock Township as he does not know what occurred there. A different unidentified gentleman asked why the Board did not ask "them" that question. Mr. Bills said Leacock has been a part of this conversation and they are in agreement with Paradise Township moving forward. Again, it goes back to the reason Gordonville is involved in this conversation is us. The resident pointed out that the map cuts off at Harvest Drive. Mr. Bills said this map was just a draft prepared by the County, but he would assume Gordonville would keep its same territory, but that would be up to Leacock.

In closing, Supervisor Marlin Groff commented he appreciates all of the comments made this evening, he understands this is a hard change, but he feels it is a positive change. Mr. Groff **motioned** for the Board



to move forward with consideration of the proposal to change first due territories. Second by Craig Keenan. Ray Rice, voted no to motion. Vice-Chairman Dennis Groff did not vote on matter as at some point during the meeting his phone connection was lost. Chairman Adams voted aye to motion. By 3 to 1 vote, **Motion Approved.**

Gentlemen asked if the public would be notified of the Township voting on this matter. Mr. Mincarelli explained the meeting Agenda would be posted to the website and posted at the building. Residents were further advised of when regular Workshop and Supervisor meetings are held. Upon request by a resident, Mr. Bills clarified that the final vote on the motion to move forward with consideration of the proposal for change of first due territories was 3 to 1 in favor of the motion.

### **ADJOURN**

- At 9:24 p.m., Marlin Groff **motioned** to adjourn meeting. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**