

MINUTES

Those in Attendance: Chairman Adam Bills, Supervisors: Ray Rice, Craig Keenan and Marlin Groff, Secretary/Treasurer Karen Farra, Zoning Officer Walter Hockensmith, Township Solicitor Frank Mincarelli, Christy Fieldsa, Jacob A. Dolbow, Blaine Stoltzfus, Jerry Garver, Bob Devonshire, Darren Neff, Sam King, Christ A. Stoltzfus, Daniel Beiler, Robert Tusing, Rick Cummings, Manny Stoltzfus, Cindy Hockensmith, Dave Anderson, Steven Stoltzfus, Steven Fisher, Paula Knosp, Joshua Knosp, James Knosp, Louise Knosp, Amos Fisher, John Stoltzfus, Ivan King, Dave Farmer, Travis Hoover, Roy Petersheim, Doug Brubaker, John Mark Stoltzfus, Jonathan King, Ivan King Alvin Stoltzfus, Elmer Esh, Jr., Sam J. Esh, Benuel Glick, Ben F. Beiler, Ben Z. Beiler, Ivan Stoltzfus, Henry Stoltzfus, Ava Stoltzfoos, Elmer Fisher, Jennifer Frank, Bob Bills, Mr. & Mrs. Nick Lopez, Ken Esh, Alvin King, Chester King, Samuel L. Esh, Amos S. Fisher, Adam Weidman, Loretta McClarigan, Kevin McClarigan, Sue D. Groff, Cindy Rapp, Fran Sattazahn, Marcella Peyle-Ferry, Scott Weichler, Daniel Beiler, Crit Beiler, Stephen Stoltzfus, Cora & Ray Workman, Neal A. Hershey, Sam Petersheim, and numerous other township and other residents whose names were not legible on the sign-in sheet, or were not provided.

MINUTES

- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the October 14, 2021 Workshop Minutes. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the October 19, 2021 Board of Supervisors Meeting Minutes. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

TREASURERS REPORT/BILLS

- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the October 2021 Treasurer's Report. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve the November 2021 Disbursement List of Bills to be paid. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None. Comments held until all other Agenda matters addressed.

CORRESPONDENCE:

- The Factory Ministries November 19, 2021 "The Extraordinary Block Party" even announcement.
- October 29, 2021 Letter from the Pennsylvania Compensation Rating Bureau regarding PCRB Filing No. 325 to the PA Insurance Department regarding expanding the definition of "employee" in the Workers' Compensation Act to include volunteer fire company operational support personnel that do not respond to emergency calls.
- PMAA Region 4 Fall Meeting Notice & Registration Form.

- October 20, 2021 letter from Cell Coverage Mapping, LLC, regarding wireless service survey to be conducted throughout Lancaster County.
- PSP 2021 *Shop with a Cop!* event notification and donation request. Marlin Groff **motioned** to approve a \$500 donation as done in past years. Second by Craig Keenan. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Lancaster County Drug Task Force Reports for the period of January 2021 through September 2021.

TOWNSHIP REPORTS

PLANNING COMMISSION:

- Craig Keenan presented the November 2, 2021 Minutes of the Planning Commission.

ZONING HEARING BOARD:

- Reports submitted by Zoning Officer, Walter Hockensmith.
- 32 Hershey Avenue - Abner Miller - Ratify Dog Law Enforcement Notice Dated October 6, 2021 - Excessive Barking. Marlin Groff **motioned** to ratify the October 6, 2021 Dog Law Enforcement Notice. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- 3345 Lincoln Hwy E - Paradise Truck Tire - Ratify Enforcement Notice Dated October 25, 2021 - Vehicles Not Parked on a Hard Surface. Marlin Groff **motioned** to ratify the October 25, 2021 Enforcement Notice. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

PARK & RECREATION COMMISSION:

- Updates by Supervisor, Ray Rice

ROADMASTER:

- No updates provided as Roadmaster/Supervisor, Dennis Groff, was not in attendance.

SEWER AUTHORITY & SEO:

- No updates provided as Roadmaster/Supervisor, Dennis Groff, was not in attendance.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS:

- Call for Vote to Advertise 2022 Notice of Public Meetings presented at October meeting. Craig Keenan **motioned** to approve advertising. Second by Ray Rice. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Call for Vote to Advertise 2022 Proposed Budget. Secretary/Treasurer, Karen Farra, presented 2022 Proposed Budget to the Board of Supervisors for advertising. Craig Keenan **motioned** to approve advertising. Second by Ray Rice. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Tree Lighting Ceremony. Chairman Adam Bills announced this year's annual tree lighting ceremony is canceled.

- Adoption of Resolution No. 2021-16 Revising First Due Response Territories Assigned to Officially Recognized Volunteer Fire Companies.
 - Chairman Bills presented the proposed Resolution to the public for comment with the following advices:
 - The prior proposed map had been changed to expand the Bart Township coverage area.
 - Commented as to the reason Strasburg Fire Company had removed Gordonville Fire & EMS from its call boxes and stated the Board of Supervisors found this action to be unacceptable.
 - Stated the Township is looking to move toward a consolidation of emergency services. In so doing, The Township has tried to work with everyone, but Paradise/Leaman Place Fire Company has continually refused to participate and stated they just want to be left alone.
 - The Board of Supervisors needs everyone to pull in the same direction to make a consolidation work, and that is not happening.
 - Marlin Groff **motioned** to limit public comment to three minutes per person. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**

PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

Chairman Bills opened the floor for public comment requesting each person state their name, township of residence and/or organization they belong to when called upon to comment.

- John Stoltzfus, Chief of Strasburg Fire Company. Chief Stoltzfus advised Strasburg removed Gordonville from only one call box in the northwest quadrant which did not affect fire or EMT response times. He stated this was done because of how Paradise/Leaman Fire Company is being treated and to send a message to Gordonville. He feels it is unacceptable that no notice was given to Strasburg Fire Company regarding the change to their on call territory. Chief Stoltzfus further stated he expects there to be no firehouse politics in their township. Chief Stoltzfus presented a “Full Incident Detail” report relating to the Don Ranck Farm barn fire that occurred on April 11, 2018, including dispatch and response details. A copy of this report was provided to the Township Secretary for the record. In response to the question of who initiated the consolidation discussions, Chairman Bills stated the Township did - not Gordonville.
- Steven Shear, Paradise Township Resident. Mr. Shear had several comments/questions throughout the meeting regarding the steps the Township has taken toward consolidation, voiced his general dissent of change to first due territories and consolidation, involvement of Leacock Township, and getting notice out to the public more effectively when there are major issues. Chairman Bills advised Leacock Township supports Paradise Township’s actions to move toward consolidation, but Mr. Shear would have to speak directly with Leacock Township regarding any other questions related to their operations within Leacock Township. Chairman Bills stated that Paradise Township will still be well-served and that the Township does not want to shutdown Paradise/Leaman Place. The Board of Supervisors reached out to all fire companies in the area to

discuss the change in first due territories and consolidation. Chairman Bills stated that Kinzer Fire Company has also been an integral part of the discussions, as well as Paradise/Leaman Place and Gordonville.

- Henry Stoltzfus commented/asked if the citizens of Paradise matter to the Township.
- Neal Hershey, Chief, Paradise/Leaman Place Fire Company. Chief Hershey advised he received a call from the County that they will not be able to dispatch if they have no insurance. Chairman Bills advised the Township will not drop insurance and that its expectation is for all three entities to consolidate and continue to serve the community. Chief Hershey further commented that there has been a roller coaster of emotions throughout consolidation discussions, but all of their members sat down to discuss the matter, and Paradise/Leaman Place advised the Task Force they preferred DCED involvement, but the Township said no. Chairman Bills responded that Supervisor Dennis Groff suggested going through DCED and he, Chairman Bills, suggested Task Force. At a Board of Supervisors meeting, the matter was discussed and upon a majority vote, it was decided the Task Force would be established. Paradise/Leaman Place participated in the Task Force, but resisted all consolidation efforts and repeatedly said they just wanted to be left alone.
- Daniel Beiler. Mr. Beiler expressed his disappointment in what the Township is doing and feels this is uncalled for. He stated he is disappointed that Dennis Groff is not here. Chairman Bills advised Mr. Groff is in the hospital and that all are upset he cannot be here.
- Mr. Thompson expressed opposition to the Board of Supervisors' involvement in emergency services, and politics being involved in any decision making. He commented regarding Gordonville trying to merge with Intercourse and when Intercourse said no, all was quiet. He feels that the Township is forcing the consolidation on Paradise/Leaman Place and that it is unfair. Chairman Bills responded that municipal boundaries are not a consideration with regard to the provision of emergency services to the community. When the Township learned of two multimillion dollar facilities being constructed, it felt it was important to pursue consolidation efforts to look at working together to provide long-term quality emergency services to the community. Supervisor Marlin Groff stated that it is known there is currently a redundancy in emergency service providers - there is a 90% overlap in territory coverage. The Township needs to look at better use of emergency service resources (i.e., personnel, equipment, etc.) to better serve the community for the long-term.
- Daniel Glick. Mr. Glick disclosed he is not a member of any of the fire companies. He commented that the Township should consider having an EMT station only for Gordonville as they do a great job. Paradise/Leaman Place does a great job on 30 and for fire response. He feels Ronks, Kinzer and Paradise/Leaman Place are much better equipped to respond to Paradise Township emergency services needs for fires and on Rout 30 than Bart, Gordonville and Strasburg. Mr. Glick stated he thinks the Township is looking more toward Gordonville's interests, and not Paradise/Leaman Place's. He urged that the Supervisors not vote on this matter tonight. Supervisor Marlin Groff expressed Mr. Glick's thoughts and ideas were good ones that need to be considered for consolidation. Chairman Bills replied that the Township has been trying to get all three fire companies to discuss the matters Mr. Glick mentioned as part of consolidation efforts; however, Paradise/Leaman Place has refused to discuss and consistently said no to any consolidation.
- Barry Yunkin, Paradise/Leaman Place Fire Company. Mr. Yunkin said ideas were brought to the table during consolidation discussions, but were shot down. He wanted to know if Emergency

Services Consolidation Task Force would resume discussions. Chairman Bills responded that the committee will not be reformed.

- Kevin McClarigan, Paradise Township Resident and Business Owner. Mr. McClarigan relayed his involvement in the Township over the past 30 years and referenced other major and tough decisions that the Township has had to make over those years (i.e., new Township building, water quality issues due to on-lot sewage, public sewer system, etc.). Mr. McClarigan expressed support of consolidation of emergency services; however, urged now as he did at a prior Workshop Meeting, that discussions not be abandoned, that the Township stay the course, but with the involvement of DCED, and follow DCED's recommendations. He feels more planning needs to occur before any decisions are made and urged the fire companies to put a hold on construction of their new facilities until discussions are completed. Mr. McClarigan urged the Supervisors to hold off on voting on the Resolution until Supervisor Dennis Groff is present and further DCED involvement is accomplished. Chairman Bills responded that DCED is involved and the Township is waiting on them to get back to the Township. He further expressed the concern that Paradise/Leaman Place has expressed no willingness to pull together. Mr. McClarigan acknowledged the immature and emotional responses from Paradise/Leaman Place in response to the Township's efforts to discuss consolidation, but urged the Township to please take its time and allow for emotional healing.
- Bob Devonshire. Mr. Devonshire thanked Mr. McClarigan for his comments and expressed his agreement with same. He also urged the Township to take its time - this is not emergent. Mr. Devonshire pointed out to Paradise/Leaman Place and the Supervisors that they had merged before, and it can be done again. He further echoed Mr. McClarigan's sentiments, offered to be a part of the DCED process, and urged the Township to take a pause pending DCED's involvement.
- Scott Weichler. Mr. Weichler commented that the Task Force only met for five months. Rick Kane stated it took two years for the consolidation he was part of to be completed. He urged the Township to take its time in handling this matter and asked why Paradise/Leaman Place refused to consider consolidation. He further stated that the Township needs to show empathy and work with Paradise/Leaman Place to get them to pull together. Mr. Weichler said we have three good solvent entities to work with and the time needs to be taken to do this right. Chairman Bills responded to Mr. Weichler's question about why Paradise/Leaman Place was not willing to consider consolidation citing there was a laundry list of reasons and encouraged him to ask them.
- Ben Beiler. Mr. Beiler asked why Task Force was chosen. Chairman Bills said the Township thought it would be better for the three organizations to work together. Mr. Beiler commented the Township needs to listen to that input and not disregard it. Chairman Bills stated the Supervisors spoke to all here at the meetings and to the public/community before any decisions were made.
- Clint Younce. Mr. Younce commented that Supervisor Dennis Groff is retiring at the end of the year. He stated, has the Township designated a replacement for him on the Board of Supervisors and what does the Township get out of this if Gordonville takes over? Chairman Bills responded that no one has been selected as of yet to replace Dennis and the Township will gain nothing directly from a consolidation of emergency services - only the community.
- Christy Fieldsa. Mrs. Fieldsa urged the Township to hold off on voting and encouraged the Township to hold a public forum to educate the community. She feels the consolidation will be good, but that it is bigger than just the Board of Supervisors. Ms. Fieldsa expressed her appreciation of all of the volunteers at all of the fire companies.

- Samuel (last name not provided). Samuel asked if the system in place today is broken? He said it is not. Chairman Bills replied that the shortage of drivers is the biggest issue for all of the fire companies and he feels a consolidation of emergency services would do something about that.
- Unnamed gentlemen asked how the Supervisors are elected. Chairman Bills explained that the voters and residents of Paradise Township vote for and elect the Supervisors.
- Nick Lopez. Mr. Lopez expressed the need for the Township to keep the residents more and better informed.
- Sam Petersheim. Mr. Petersheim responded to Mr. Lopez's comment asking how is the Township supposed to get people to come out here. The meetings are held the same day of every month and the people need to show up. Mr. Petersheim further commented regarding the Supervisors' voting to go with the Task Force rather than DCED stating he was at that meeting and remembers mocking Dennis. He thought the people of the fire companies would be better at making decisions for themselves than the State.
- Doug Brubaker, Kinzer Fire Company. Chairman Bills commented that everyone needs to remember that Kinzer Fire Company has been an integral part of the consolidation discussions as well and called on Mr. Brubaker for his comments on the matter. Mr. Brubaker expressed that Kinzer Fire Company is in favor of a merger and after having discussions with the various fire companies, feels it makes sense for all three fire companies to merge.
- Mr. King (first name not heard). Mr. King commented he always thought the Board of Supervisors were there for the Township, so why would it not send out letters to all of the residents.
- Jake Dolbow. Mr. Dolbow stated that he is new to Paradise. He was a volunteer with Gap for 16 years and has been a volunteer with Paradise/Leaman Place for 1 year. He urged the Township to take its time in making any decisions. There are no staffing or funding issues for the fire companies at this time, so the Township can take its time.
- Jonas Fisher & Barry Yunkin, Paradise/Leaman Place Fire Company. Mr. Fisher asked if there was any reason this matter had to be pushed through - if Paradise/Leaman were to hold off on building plans until DCED comes through, would this be reasonable? He feels the Township should not skip step one of the DCED process - the study. He further commented that he feels there would be less resistance to the consolidation by Paradise/Leaman Place if DCED does a study and handles the consolidation, as he thinks the Township was biased in the study conducted by the Task Force. Barry Yunkin of Paradise/Leaman Place agreed with Mr. Fishers comment regarding bias. General sentiment was expressed by Mr. Fisher and Mr. Yunkin that the Task Force did not do it's research before pushing for consolidation, and that a third party study will be better received. Mr. Fisher stated that Paradise/Leaman Place felt there was no compromise. Mr. Yunkin supported this, stated not a lot was accomplished during the meetings and inquired what does any of this have to do with removing first due at this time? Mr. Fisher commented that it feels like the Township is punishing Paradise/Leaman Place for not agreeing to the consolidation. Mr. Fisher asked if the current situation would be different now if the a DCED study happened.
- Unnamed Resident asked who selected Task Force. Chairman Bills responded that the Supervisors went into this process looking towards consolidation. Supervisor Marlin Groff commented that looking at this matter as a neutral third party with no affiliation with any of the three organizations, it makes sense to consolidate when 2 of the 3 organization involved think it should happen. The Task Force was made up of local representatives of each organization with the participation of Rick Kane as a third party, without anything to gain or lose, but whom had gone through the consolidation process himself.

- Ivan James. Mr. James stated that he has been a member of Paradise/Leaman Place for 28 years. During that time, the Township has done a lot for them, but he feels they are getting “shafted” this year and that the Board of Supervisors do not appreciate their volunteers.
- Unnamed Resident. Asked if Paradise/Leaman Place was showing a willingness to consolidate, would this change of first due not happen? Chairman Bills responded yes. Gentlemen then asked what is Paradise/Leaman Place’s real objection to consolidation? Chairman Bills said he needs to ask Paradise/Leaman Place that question.
- Unnamed Gentlemen commented that if the Supervisors vote today, Paradise/Leaman Place would have no say and that he hopes they will work with DCED to do consolidation. He then asked those in attendance if any are in favor of consolidation. Five people raised their hands.
- Elmer (last name not heard), Paradise Resident, stated that it does make more sense to him to have one large fire company.
- Elmer Stoltzfus, Paradise Resident, stated he is new to Paradise/Leaman Place. He asked if consolidation would be mean that there would be no Station 47. Chairman Bills responded that any location would be determined during the consolidation process. Mr. Stoltzfus then said why not leave first due as it is until consolidation happens.

Summary of Comments/Responses of Chairman Adam Bills not stated above:

- He has spoken to many in the community who support consolidation.
- Paradise/Leaman Place was not left out of discussions - the Township has tried to keep them involved in all discussions. The Township has never wanted to shut them down.
- The Township has done its best to keep the community informed and to include them in discussions.
- DCED will help with ongoing consolidation efforts. This process has been started; however, an entire study has not been requested - only technical assistance with consolidation. A full study would take years, whereas technical assistance will take less time. DCED will work with all three fire companies during the technical assistance process for consolidation.
- Paradise/Leaman Place consistently resisted all efforts of the Task Force for consolidation. As a result, the Task Force recommended against consolidation due to the personal relationships between the fire companies. This will not change - personalities will remain the same, if a study is done by DCED as was done by the Task Force.
- In response to Mr. Fisher’s comment he felt there was no compromise, Chairman Bills said he feels there was. For example, Gordonville was open and willing to relocate and set-up procedures, but Paradise/Leaman Place was not.
- Restated the Township wants Paradise/Leaman Place involved and pulling together in the same direction. This is an opportunity for everyone to work together.

Summary of Comments/Responses of Supervisor Marlin Groff not stated above:

- He feels at this meeting and the prior month’s meeting, the Supervisors are only hearing from Paradise/Leaman Place who opposes consolidation, not from the rest of the community.
- Study done by Task Force revealed that of the three fire companies involved, two are in favor of consolidation.

- DCED will work with all three organizations to form one new entity. A step is not being missed by not having DCED do a study. A study was completed by the Task Force who found that a consolidation makes sense even if Paradise/Leaman Place does not want it. The actual consolidation will take a while.
- In response to Jonas Fisher's comment it seems the Township is punishing Paradise/Leaman Place, Supervisor Groff stated they can choose to see this process as a punishment, or an opportunity to work together.
- Supervisor Groff stated his vote will be based upon what he heard at tonight's meeting and the results of the vote by all of the Supervisors will determine the Board of Supervisors position as the Township moves forward with the consolidation process. This is a difficult decision, but it needs to be made.

At 9:02 p.m., the Board of Supervisors adjourned to meet in executive session.

At 9:16 p.m., the public meeting was reconvened.

Craig Keenan **motioned** to table voting on the Resolution to change first due territories until the full Board of Supervisors could be present to vote. Second by Ray Rice. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

ADJOURN

- At 9:18 p.m., Marlin Groff **motioned** to adjourn meeting. Second by Craig Keenan. All ayes. **Motion Approved.**