

MINUTES

Those in Attendance: Chairman Adam Bills, Vice-Chairman Allen Fisher, Supervisors: Ray Rice and Samuel Beiler, Township Manager David Thompson, Secretary/Treasurer Karen Farra, Zoning Officer Walter Hockensmith, Roadmaster Blaine Stoltzfus, Paradise Township Sewer Authority Chairman Bryan Stoltzfus, Township Solicitor Frank Mincarelli, Michael Hartmann, Steven Gergely, Donald Clark, III, Don Clark, Ron Hershey, Scott Stoltzfus, Aaron Stoltzfus, Kevin Witmier, Charles R. Groff, Dwight Groff, Sam Petersheim, Steve Shearer, Dave Shearer, Clint Younce, Wendel Ranck, Wanda Ranck, Dave Anderson, Jerry Mitchell, Paula Knosp, Joshua Knosp, Jim Knosp, Dominick Lopez, Ron Schmerfeld, Edie Schmerfeld, Harold Cashy, Janet Cashy, Bob Devonshire, Phares Blank, Barry Yunkin, Jr., Taylor Yunkin, David King, Ivan King, Ephraim King, Christy Fieldsa, Paul S. Zook, Alvin Fisher, Ben Beiler, Matt Eberly, Sam King, Marcella Peyre-Ferry, Henry Stoltzfus, Daniel Blank, Steven Fisher, Ivan Fisher, Henry S. Fisher, Jonas Fisher, Ivan Stoltzfus, Travis Hoover, Daniel Beiler, Ervin Fisher, and other residents who did not sign in.

CALL TO ORDER/FLAG CEREMONY AT 7:02 P.M.

PUBLIC HEARING:

- Presented to the public for comment Ordinance No. 2022-04, An Ordinance Repealing Ordinance 2006-1 and Authorizing the Proper Officers to Withdraw the Township from the Intergovernmental Insurance Cooperative (“IIC”), Notice having been duly advertised in a newspaper of general circulation on October 4, 2022. No comments being received, Samuel Beiler **motioned** to adopt Ordinance No. 2022-04. Second by Allen Fisher. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

ADJOURN PUBLIC HEARING AT 7:04 P.M.

MINUTES

- Allen Fisher **motioned** to approve the Board of Supervisors Meeting Minutes for September 20, 2022. Second by Ray Rice. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

TREASURERS REPORT/BILLS

- Ray Rice **motioned** to approve the September 2022 Treasurer’s Report. Second by Allen Fisher. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Samuel Beiler **motioned** to approve the October 2022 Disbursement List of Bills to be paid. Second by Allen Fisher. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Steven Gergely, RLA, Harbor Engineering – Paradise Square/Don Clark – 3109 Lincoln Hwy E, 17 & 22 Leacock Rd: Mr. Gergely present plans with request for conditional plan approval and approval of the following modification/waiver requests (Rettew recommends approval of requests based on justification provided in their August 22, 2022 Review No. 1 Letter):
 - a. Waiver of Section 602.5 – Reconstruction of Existing Streets.
 - b. Waiver of Section 602.7 – Right-of-Way and Cartway Width.
 - c. Deferral of Section 602.11 – Curbs.
 - d. Deferral of Section 602.12 Sidewalk.

Allen Fisher **motioned** to approval all waiver/modification requests. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

Allen Fisher **motioned** for conditional approval of the land development plans. Second by Ray Rice. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Ron Hershey, Hershey Surveying – Aaron B. & Mary Ruth Stoltzfus – 218 S. Kinzers Rd – Lot Add-on Plan: Mr. Hershey presented plans with request for conditional approval of the plans and approval of the modification/waiver request of Section 403.3 & 406.C - Existing Features to not have to provide a separate existing features sheet. Rettew recommends approval of this modification request based upon the justification and alternative provided.

Allen Fisher **motioned** to approve waiver/modification request. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

Allen Fisher **motioned** for conditional approval of Lot Add-on plans. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Ron Hershey, Hershey Surveying, Inc. – Scott D. & Jodi L. Stoltzfus – 5 N. Belmont Rd – Lot Add-on Plan: Ron Hershey presented plans with request for conditional approval of plans and modification from Sections 403.3 & 406.C – Existing Features with proposal to include both existing and proposed features on one sheet. Discussion was had regarding retaining walls being in right-of-way. Township Solicitor Frank Mincarelli advised that as the retaining walls are not in the cartway and these plans represent a lot line change only, he would recommend approval of the plans with the caveat a note be added to the plan that this matter would need to be revisited if future plans are submitted for land development.

Ray Rice **motioned** to approve waiver/modification request. Second by Allen Fisher. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

Allen Fisher **motioned** for approval of the Lot Add-on plans conditioned upon all engineer review comments being addressed and a note added to the plans consistent with the recommendations of the Township Solicitor. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Kevin Witmier, Impact Engineering Group – Charles & Janet Groff – 35 S. Kinzers Rd – Minor Subdivision Plan: Mr. Witmier appeared and presented plans with request for conditional approval. Mr. Witmier advised the sewer module previously approved by the Board of Supervisors is awaiting PA DEP approval – approval is anticipated to be received by end of November. Discussion was had regarding a speed study and sight safe stopping distance. It was noted a speed study would be done at such time as development of the lot is proposed. Mr. Fisher indicated that the Planning Commission agreed that due to existing conditions and no lot development being proposed at this time, the plans be approved with the sight safe stopping distance as shown. Allen Fisher **motioned** for conditional approval of the plans. Second by Ray Rice. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

CORRESPONDENCE:

- The Factory Ministries November 18, 2022 ExtraGive Extraordinary Block Party Announcement.
- South Central Assembly Community Webinar Series email regarding October 26, 2022 webinar “Preparing for the New Federal Infrastructure Program”.
- PSATS Unemployment Compensation Group Trust October 14, 2022 notice of a one-tenth of a percent (.10%) contribution rate increase for 2023.
- LCTCB 2022 Member Meeting materials.

TOWNSHIP REPORTS

TOWNSHIP MANAGER

- Updates/Report by Township Manager, David Thompson.
- August 29, 2022 Letter from Benecon and the Intergovernmental Insurance Cooperative (“IIC”) regarding terms of Agreement with the IIC and plan termination penalties and costs.
- October 4, 2022 Letter from Benecon and the IIC in response to notice the Township intends to withdraw from the IIC.

ROADMASTER:

- Updates/Report by Roadmaster, Blaine Stoltzfus.
- Mr. Rice asked Mr. Stoltzfus when Public Works would be closing the park restrooms. Mr. Stoltzfus said the first week of November.

EMERGENCY SERVICES

- Updates by Township Manager, David Thompson.

- September 2022 Emergency Services Call Report.
- Review and discuss revised proposed Knox Box ordinance. If determine proposed ordinance is acceptable, approve advertising it. The Supervisors presented the proposed ordinance to the public for discussion. Comments were received as follows:
 - Sam Petersheim: Mr. Petersheim asked if the Knox boxes would be required on existing multifamily buildings, and what are they and how do they work? He asked how often the keys are checked as he knows on his property, he changes the keys a lot when renters change, and sometimes the renters change the locks on their own and doesn't have a key. Mr. Petersheim is not currently in favor of Knox boxes being required on existing multifamily residential buildings.
 - David Anderson, Deputy Chief, Kinzer Fire Company: In response to Mr. Petersheim's inquiries, Mr. Anderson explained Knox boxes and how they work. He said, typically, an annual check sheet is sent to the owners to verify keys in the box are current. Mr. Anderson said he thinks Knox boxes are more suited for use in buildings with alarm systems, not so much apartments.
 - Dominick Lopez: Mr. Lopez asked if the ordinance would apply to existing and new buildings. Mr. Bills said yes.

General discussion was had regarding zoning ordinance definitions and ensuring the Ordinance aligns with the definitions in the Zoning Ordinance, and the feasibility of requiring Knox boxes on buildings without alarm systems. It was resolved Section 1, Paragraph A. 4. be stricken from the proposed Ordinance.

Allen Fisher **motioned** to have Section 1, Paragraph A. 4. stricken from the Ordinance and the revised Ordinance duly advertised for adoption at the November 15, 2022 meeting of the Board of Supervisors. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Paradise Leaman Place Fire Company email with Fire Relief Funds request.
- Gordonville Fire & EMS Fire Relief Funds Request (Witmer Quote).

PLANNING COMMISSION:

- Updates by Supervisor, Allen Fisher.
- Samuel & Susie Stoltzfus – Belmont Fabric: Mr. Thompson provided status update on this project including summary of comments in September 28, 2022 email chain between Township Solicitor and the Stoltzfus' Attorney, Reilly Noetzel, regarding property line setback requirements.

ZONING HEARING BOARD:

- Report presented by Zoning Officer, Walter Hockensmith.

PARK & RECREATION COMMISSION:

- Updates by Supervisor, Ray Rice.
- Mr. Rice announced the park restrooms would be closed and the portable toilets removed the first week of November.

SEWER AUTHORITY & SEO:

- September 12, 2022 Minutes of Paradise Township Sewer Authority.
- Ray Rice **motioned** to appoint Jonathon B. Stoltzfus as a member to the Paradise Township Sewer Authority Board. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Updates as needed by Township Manager, David Thompson (there were no updates).

OLD/NEW BUSINESS:

- Allen Fisher **motioned** to approve advertising of Notice of 2023 Public Meetings. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**
- Secretary/Treasurer presented proposed 2023 Budget for public comment. Comment was received as follows:
 - Wanda Ranck: Mrs. Ranck asked were the excess funds from defunding Paradise-Leaman Place Fire Company were going. It was explained to her that the allocation of funds to the fire companies was still being determined. It was confirmed for her that starting in 2022, the Township began to contribute funds towards the cost for Bart Township Fire Company's workers' compensation insurance, and that, historically, the Township has paid the workers' compensation and general liability insurance premiums for Paradise Leaman Place and Kinzer Fire Companies. The use and allocation of Firemans' Relief Act Funds and Local Service Tax revenue was also explained to her with the advices that allocation of these funds in 2023 is still being determined.

Ray Rice **motioned** to approve advertising of the 2023 Budget. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

- Daniel Z. Stoltzfus – 35 Pequea Valley Rd – Broom Shop: Request for release of Financial Security. Refer to Rettew's October 12, 2022 As-Built Plan Review #1 recommending a partial release of the Financial Security in the amount of \$32,398.76, leaving a remaining Financial Security Balance of \$10,000. Samuel Beiler **motioned** to approve partial release of the Financial Security in the amount of \$32,398.76. Second by Allen Fisher. All Ayes. **Motion Approved.**

PERSONS TO BE HEARD/PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Wendel Ranck: Mr. Ranck read prepared statement regarding merger of fire companies and operational concerns at emergency response to barn fire. He stated he feels they would have fared better during the fire if Paradise Leaman Place Fire Company had been there and asked how the Supervisors can justify Paradise Leaman Place not serving during the merger efforts.

- Wanda Ranck: Ms. Ranck expressed her continued frustration with the Supervisors for removing Paradise Leaman Place from first due and the call boxes and asked what is the real purpose for shutting them down, and why can't they be put back on calls.
 - Chairman Bills Responded: Paradise Leaman Place is not shut down. It was an operational decision by the other fire companies to take them off the boxes. Everyone still wanted them on calls even after taken off of first due; however, the operational decision to remove them from the boxes was made due to issues on scenes during responses. Meetings are happening between Paradise Leaman Place and the merger Steering Committee. Those meetings have been very constructive and the goal is to have them back on calls. Mr. Bills said comments degrading other fire companies are not acceptable.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher Responded: There have been meetings with Paradise Leaman Place to discuss and establish standard operating procedures and all want nothing more than to have them back on calls.
- Steve Shearer: Mr. Shearer expressed continued frustration with fire company merger and Paradise Leaman Place being removed from first due and call boxes. He asked if meetings are going on, why isn't Paradise Leaman Place back on calls. He commented again about an email from earlier in the year from Gordonville stating they did not want to take Paradise Leaman Place's territory and accused Mr. Bills of not sharing the email with the other Supervisors. Mr. Shearer asked Mr. Bills if he thinks it is right that Paradise Leaman Place was not on the call for an accident on Lincoln Highway right in front of their firehouse. Mr. Shearer also asked why Mr. Keenan was not at the last two meetings.
 - Chairman Bills Responded: The email with Gordonville was shared with the sitting Board of Supervisors at the time (Mr. Fisher was not on the Board then), but the decision had already been made to remove Paradise Leaman Place from first due. He explained the Board of Supervisors makes decisions regarding first due territory, but not who is or is not on the boxes – that is an operational decision made by the serving fire companies. Mr. Bills said under the circumstances at the time, he feels it was appropriate that Paradise Leaman Place was not on the call to the incident on Lincoln Highway and re-emphasized that very constructive meetings are happening. In the meantime, there are a lot of "what ifs" being said and decisions cannot be made on "what ifs". Mr. Bills said they are working towards the goal of having Paradise Leaman Place back on calls. Mr. Bills explained Mr. Keenan had other obligations keeping him from the September and October meetings, but believes he will be back for the November meeting.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher Responded: Mr. Fisher explained the merger Steering Committee is working towards getting Paradise Leaman Place back on calls, but they are trying not to rush things. They are working on getting standard operating procedures in place before making any changes.
 - Ray Rice Responded: Mr. Rice and asked Bob Devonshire how long it would take to put Paradise Leaman Place back on the boxes once that decision is made. Mr. Devonshire said it could be completed over one night.
- Sam Petersheim: Mr. Petersheim explained he has been coming to these Board of Supervisor Meetings for a while now. He remembers the Ranck's barn fire 4 years ago and how he saw Ronks, Gap, Lafayette, Gordonville and Kinzers there, but not Paradise Leaman Place. He said at that incident,

the volunteers were helpful and the ones that ran with Gap, Kinzer and Gordonville didn't leave a mark. Mr. Petersheim said he feels the Township is on the right track and doing the right thing.

- Noah Fisher: Mr. Fisher feels the work being done for the merger is not being done in an honest and proper way. He thinks all should go back to day one, hit the restart button, and communicate in an honest and proper way. He feels the Supervisors have been lying to them and wishes this could be fixed. He said he heard Paradise Leaman Place is getting first due back.
 - Chairman Bills Responded: Mr. Bills responded that Paradise Leaman Place is communicating with the Township and the merger Steering Committee and those communications have been constructive.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher Responded: With regard to Mr. Noah Fisher's comment he heard Paradise Leaman Place was getting first due back, Vice Chairman Fisher explained first due would be given back under the new department formed as a result of the merger, which would include Paradise Leaman Place when they join the merger.
- Clint Younce: Mr. Younce said he heard that there was a meeting with the fire companies 3-4 weeks ago and he was told that at that meeting, Gordonville said things are getting out of control and Paradise Leaman Place needs to tell the community to back off. He asked if that is true.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher said he has no knowledge of that and wishes Paradise Leaman Place would be honest with the public.
- Daniel Beiler: Mr. Beiler said he was upset that the Supervisors were telling the community that Paradise Leaman Place was being resistant when they were not. He then said they may have been resistant, but they aren't the only ones. He said at last month's meeting he had said he felt insulted when Paradise Leaman Place was put on stand by for the Ranck barn fire, but realized it was not an insult. It was the County looking out for them. He then stated that Paradise Leaman Place was on two calls over the weekend and they are thankful for that.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher responded it was a highlight to have Paradise Leaman Place on the brush fire call, and he hopes this continues.
- Paula Knosp: Mrs. Knosp asked what happened to the Supervisors' monthly updates about the status of the merger would be provided to the public. She feels that monthly briefings by the Board of Supervisors would clear-up a lot of miscommunications.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher said he will talk to the Steering Committee to see if they can make that work.
- Levi Esh, Jr., of Leacock: Mr. Esh stated he has been with Gordonville for 30 years and he knows for a fact that Gordonville wanted more territory. He said the Township is in charge of providing fire protection and he hears with Gordonville and Kinzer merging, there will be one checkbook. He further commented that if they merge, we could be without a fire company. He also said that Leacock Township is not aware of what is happening with this merger.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher explained that once the merger is complete, there will be one new fire company – the Pequea Valley Fire Department.
 - Township Solicitor Frank Mincarelli responded that Leacock Township is well aware of the situation as they have been involved since the beginning having had a member on the Consolidation Task Force.
- Ephraim King: Mr. King expressed his concern for resident's fire safety with Paradise Leaman Place not being on calls. He said there have been a lot of emotions and this situation has been really hard. He stated the Township is responsible for fire coverage, the Supervisors make the decisions, "you

men are not animals”. He wants to see the matter resolved peacefully. He had a fire and Paradise Leaman Place, Strasburg and Gordonville Fire Companies all came and he really appreciated that. He finds it disturbing knowing the closest fire company is not on first due. Mr. King said he thinks 47 (Paradise Leaman Place) should go back on calls like it was before until the merger is resolved. He is fine with whomever responds, but wants Paradise Leaman Place to be able to respond too. He then said you all (Supervisors) make mistakes – you are human and it is okay, but you just need to fix it now. You are gentlemen who can make good decisions. Let’s move this forward peacefully.

- Ben Beiler: With regard to Leacock Township’s involvement on the Consolidation Task Force, Mr. Beiler asked if Mr. Bills could explain the result of the task force.
 - Chairman Bills said that due to the animosity between the fire companies, the task force recommended against the consolidation.
- Phares Blank: Mr. Blank asked why the Township is playing God with people’s lives, why do the Supervisors think they have the right to make these changes? He asked why Paradise Leaman Place was taken off the boxes and if the Supervisors are in charge of first due.
 - Chairman Bills Responded: Yes, the Supervisors are able to make decisions regarding fire protection and first due territories. It is the belief of the Supervisors that the merger is best for the fire companies and the Township for continued fire protection now and in the future.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher Responded: The Township does not make decision regarding who is on the boxes. Once it was decided to move forward with the merger and to change first due territories, Paradise Leaman was still on the boxes. They were removed from the boxes later on due to animosity on scenes.
- Sam King, Cherry Hill Rd: Mr. King said everyone keeps saying there is a lot of misinformation out there so why not have a public meeting with all of the fire companies to clear things up. He said he also heard that Gordonville Ambulance is not going to be separate from the fire company. Why not? Garden Spot did that.
 - Vice Chairman Fisher Responded: Mr. Fisher asked Mr. King if he thought the suggested public meeting would work, to which he responded yes.
 - Chairman Bills Responded: Mr. Bills said Garden Spot has been involved in the merger discussions.

ADJOURN

- At 8:35p.m., Allen Fisher **motioned** to adjourn meeting. Second by Samuel Beiler. All Ayes.
Motion Approved.